Nationalism and National Identity in Twentieth-Century Latin America

Field of Study: MA in Modern History (UCL)
Major or minor option: MA in Area Studies; MSc in Politics (ISA)

Professor Nicola Miller, UCL
Mondays 10-12, Room 304, Department of History, 24 Gordon Square [entrance is at the back of the building; then go up to the third floor].

Approach and structure: Latin American history since independence has been shaped by the process of constructing modern nation-states, yet the issue of nationalism -- as either ideology or historical process -- is usually addressed only indirectly in the existing historiography, and there are few sustained attempts to analyse Latin American experiences of nation-building in a comparative context. Questions of national identity have received far more attention, but their cultural manifestations have usually been studied out of context from the broader political process. The aim of this course is to fill these gaps by exploring Latin American nationalisms in a comparative context, and by analysing the relationship between nationalism and national identity in Latin America.

The course will open with three sessions introducing debates in the theory of nationalism, and then proceed to test the main approaches, namely perennialism, modernism and post-modernism, against Latin American experiences. The rest of the course will be organised around themes and debates in twentieth-century Latin American politics, which will be brought up to the present to incorporate the question of whether the concept of the nation-state is still relevant to the analysis of contemporary Latin American societies, especially given the recent emphasis on transnational history.

We will draw on material from a variety of Latin American countries. Primary source material (available in translation for those of you just beginning to read Spanish) will be introduced where possible and appropriate. Secondary material will be drawn from a range of disciplines: political theory, politics, international relations, history, cultural studies, anthropology, etc. Readings will be assigned on a weekly basis, and the course will be conducted mainly through seminar discussion.

Assessment:

ISA students: 3 essays of 3,000 words each (25% of final mark) and an unseen examination of 3 questions in 3 hours (75%). Essays must be comparative in approach (at least two countries).
Deadlines: see the information provided by ISA.

UCL students: 2 essays of 4,000 words each, which must be comparative in approach (at least two countries).
Deadlines: see the information at the back of this list.

Contacting me: If you want to see me individually, usually the best thing to do is to mention it at class and we can make an appointment. I hold office hours, when you can drop in without an appointment, on Tuesdays, 2-4pm. My email is Nicola.Miller@ucl.ac.uk.
Telephone: 020 7679 3897 (33897 if you are calling from a UCL extension).
Summary of Topics

**Term 1 (teaching starts Monday 5 October)**

1. Introduction

2. Theories of nationalism: Modernism and Perennialism

3. Theories of nationalism: Imagined Communities and Beyond

4. The Gender of Nationhood

5. State and Nation: Constitutions and Citizenship; Warfare and Militarism

**READING WEEK -- No seminar**

6. Ideologies of Race

7. Race: Inclusion and Exclusion: The Indigenous Peoples

8. Race: Inclusion and Exclusion: Afro-Latin Americans

9. The Role of the Other: Anti-Imperialism

10. The Role of the Other: Economic Nationalism

**Term 2 (starts 11 January)**

11. State and Nation: Populism and Education

12. What difference did a Revolution make? Cuba and Nicaragua

13. Writing the Nation: National Character Essays; Novels; Poetry

14. History, Memory and Commemoration

15. Visualising the Nation

**READING WEEK – No seminar**

16. Embodying the Nation: Music, Sport, Food and Dress

17. Icons and Iconography

18. The Mass Media: Film, Radio, Television

19. Geographies of Nationhood: Regions and Borders

20. Conclusions: The Future of Nationalism in Latin America

**Course Bibliography**
1. Introduction: -- What is a Nation?
   -- The Historiography of Latin American Nationalism

What is a Nation? -- Readings (handouts):

-- Raymond Williams, *Keywords*, 1976.
-- Ernest Renan, ‘What is a nation?’ [1882], from Homi Bhabha, *Nation and Narration*, 1990.

Two very useful readers on nationalism (either of these would be worth buying):

The Historiography of Nationalism in Latin America


Work began in the 1960s, mostly either from a Cold War perspective (nationalism as a threat to US hegemony) or from a dependency perspective (nationalism as a defence against imperialist exploitation). They all have a very dated feel to them now, but it is worth taking a quick look at some of them, not least to appreciate how greatly approaches to the issues have changed since then. See:


Interest in Latin American nationalism and -- above all -- national identity flourished in the 1990s, and it is this work that forms the basis of this course. Here is a short list of introductory reading. These books will also be useful throughout the course.


Sara Castro-Klarén and John Charles Chasteen, eds., *Beyond Imagined Communities: Reading and Writing the Nation in Nineteenth-Century Latin America*, 2003.

Don Doyle and Marco Antonio Pamplona, eds., *Nationalism in the New World*, 2006.


In this course, we will focus mostly on the twentieth century, drawing on material from the nineteenth century where relevant. On the *Wars of Independence*, see the following:


2. **Theories of nationalism** (I): Modernism and Perennialism

**Main readings:**

John Hutchinson and Anthony D. Smith, eds., *Nationalism*, Oxford Readers, 1994. Extracts nos. 9 & 10 [***], 12 and 16 from modernists (Gellner, Hobsbawm and Ranger, Breuilly); extracts nos. 17, 18 [***], 21 and 22 from perennialists (Smith, Hutchinson, Armstrong).


A useful short survey of the modernist approach (although it does not address Latin America): John Breuilly, ‘Approaches to Nationalism’ [***], in Gopal Balakrishnan, ed., *Mapping the Nation*, 1996 [an interesting collection overall; worth buying].

**Further Reading**

Walker Connor, ‘A nation is a nation, is a state, is an ethnic group is a …’, *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 1:4 (1978) contains useful discussion of terms as well as the broader issues [***]. He also has a book on the subject: *Ethnonationalism: The Quest for Understanding*, 1994. Connor draws upon both modernist and perennialist approaches.


3. **Theories of nationalism (II) -- Imagined Communities and Beyond**


See also Anderson’s introduction to G. Balakrishnan, ed., *Mapping the Nation*, 1996.

**Critiques of Anderson:**

Claudio Lomnitz, ‘Nationalism as a Practical System: Benedict Anderson’s Theory of Nationalism From the Vantage Point of Spanish America’, in Miguel Angel Centeno and Fernando López Alves, eds., *The Other Mirror: Grand Theory Through the Lens of Latin America*, 2000. ***


This is a useful reference book beyond these extracts.
Homi Bhabha, *Nation and Narration*, 1990, esp. the introduction and the chapter by Doris Sommer on Latin America [***]. Bhabha’s concluding chapter, ‘DissemiNation’ is also worth reading, although his prose is notoriously opaque.

Frantz Fanon, *The Wretched of the Earth*, trans. Constance Farrington, Penguin, 1967. This is one of the most powerful manifestos against the effects of colonialism on former colonies, especially on their culture, and is often referred to in the literature on post-colonialism. See the extract ‘On National Culture’ [***], in Patrick Williams and Laura Chrisman, *Colonial Discourse and Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, 1993.


Further reading


4. The Gender of Nationhood

**Introduction:** Geoff Eley, ‘Culture, Nation and Gender’, in Ida Blom et al., eds., *Gendered Nations: Nationalism and Gender Order in the Long Nineteenth Century*, 2000. ***
Further reading

Emilie Bergmann et al., *Women, Culture and Politics in Latin America*, 1990.
Marifran Carlson, *¡Feminismo! The Women’s Movement in Argentina from its beginnings to Eva Perón*, 1988.
Elizabeth Dore and Maxine Molyneux (eds.), *Hidden Histories of Gender and the State in Latin America*, 2000.

5. State and Nation (I) -- Constitutions and Citizenship
   -- Warfare and Militarism

Constitutions and Citizenship: Main readings

The constitutions of Argentina (1853 and 1994) and Peru (1933). ***

For a translation of the Peronist Constitution, see The Constitution of the Argentine Nation, 1949 [in the LSE library]; Peru’s 1993 constitution is available in Spanish in the British Library.

For comparison: the constitutions of Mexico (1917) and Chile (1925). ***

Other constitutions can be found in Russell H. Fitzgibbon, The Constitutions of the Americas, 1948.

Further Reading

Luis Roniger and Mario Sznajder, eds., Constructing Collective Identities and Shaping Public Spheres, 1998.

Argentina:


**Peru:**

Peter Klaren, ‘The origins of modern Peru’, in *Cambridge History of Latin America*.

**Warfare and Militarism**


6. **Ideologies of Race**

**Introduction**

One of the following:

Peter Wade, *Race and Ethnicity in Latin America*, 1997, chs. 1 and 2. ***
See also the Introduction to Appelbaum, ‘Racial Nations’, pp. 1-31. ***

**Social Darwinism and Whitening – Main Readings**

Carlos O. Bunge, extracts from *Nuestra América*, 1903. ***
Further Reading


Nancy Stepan, *The Hour of Eugenics: Race, Gender and Nation in Latin America*, 1991, esp. ch. 5.


Indigenismo and Mestizaje – Main Readings

Manuel Gamio, *Forjando patria*, 1916. ***

José C. Mariátegui, *Siete ensayos de interpretación de la realidad peruana*, 1928; trans. as *Seven Interpretative Essays on Peruvian Reality*, 1971, section on ‘The Indian Problem’. [*** in Spanish].


Further Reading on Mexico


**Peru**

Josó Deustua and José Luis Reñique, *Intelectuales, indigenismo y descentralismo en el Perú, 1897-1931*, 1984. UCL

7. **Race: Inclusion and Exclusion -- The Indigenous Peoples**

**General Reading**


Case Study -- The Mapuche in Chile


Case Study -- Mexico

‘Second Declaration of the Lacandon Jungle, 12 June 1994 in ibid. ***


**Bolivia**

8. Race: Inclusion and Exclusion – Afro-Latin American People


Further General Reading


Case Study – Colombia


Case Study -- Brazil


9. The Role of the Other: Anti-imperialism

Main Readings


José Enrique Rodó, *Ariel* [1900], esp. part V, ed. Gordon Brotherston, text in Spanish, 1967 – Brotherston’s introduction (in English) is useful; also trans. Margaret Sayers Peden, 1988, with an interesting prologue by Carlos Fuentes.***

Víctor Raúl Haya de la Torre, ‘Liberation of the Indo-American Mind’ and ‘The Historical Task of APRA’ in Robert J. Alexander, *Aprismo: The Ideas and Doctrines of Víctor Raúl Haya de la Torre*, 1973, pp. 52-63 and 149-58. *** See also ‘Imperialism, the First Stage of Capitalism’ and ‘We are not ashamed to call ourselves Indoamericans’. ***


Further Reading

C. Abel and N. Torrents, eds., *José Martí: Revolutionary Democrat*, 1986, esp. chs. 6 and 7.
Thomas Miller Klubock, Contested Communities: Class, Gender and Politics in Chile’s El Teniente Copper Mine, 1904-1951, 1998.
Nicola Miller, In the Shadow of the State, 1999, ch. 5.
M. Stabb, In Quest of Identity, ch. III, The Revolt against Scientism; and ch. IV, America Rediscovered.
Roberto Schwarz, Misplaced Ideas: Essays on Brazilian Culture, 1992, esp. ch. 1 ‘Brazilian Culture: Nationalism by Elimination’. Although Schwarz focuses on Brazil, much of what he says could well be applied across Latin America.

Case Study: -- The War of Resistance in Nicaragua (1927-33)


10. The Role of the Other: Economic Nationalism

Main readings [All ***]

Mexico, 1917, Article 27 of the Constitution [translated]
Argentina, 1922, Yrigoyen’s ‘Mensaje sobre Explotación de Minas de Petróleo’
Mexico, 1938 -- extracts from speech by President Lázaro Cárdenas, in Spanish and English.
Argentina, 1947, Perón’s ‘Declaration of Economic Independence’, in Spanish and English
Bolivia, 2006, Morales’ speech on the nationalization of gas

Further Reading

Vivienne Bennett et al., Opposing Currents: The Politics of Water and Gender in Latin America, 2005.
Robert Bond, Contemporary Venezuela and Its Role in International Affairs, 1977, ch. 4 on OPEC.
Gustavo Coronel, The Nationalization of the Venezuelan Oil Industry From Technocratic Success to Political Failure, 1983.
Robert Pastor and Jorge Castañeda, Limits to Friendship: The United States and Mexico, 1988.
George Philip, The Rise and Fall of the Peruvian Military Radicals, 1978, ch. 2: Peruvian Nationalism and the IPC.
Aníbal Quijano, Nacionalismo, neo-imperialismo y militarismo en el Perú, 1971.
Jesse Ribot and Anne Larson, eds., Democratic Decentralization through a Natural Resource Lens, 2005.
Carl Solberg, *Oil and Nationalism in Argentina*, 1979.

See also Council of Foreign Relations website on the Bolivian nationalization: http://www.cfr.org/publication/10682/bolivias_nationalization_of_oil_and_gas

11. State and Nation: Populism and Education

**Mexico – Main Reading**

Extracts from José Vasconcelos, *A Mexican Ulysses*, his autobiography, on his time at the Ministry of Education. ***

**Further Reading**


**Argentina -- Main reading:**

Extracts from Perón’s writings on education. ***

**Further reading:**


12. **What Difference Did a Revolution Make? – Cuba and Nicaragua**

**Introduction**


**Cuba**


Nicaragua

Extracts from speeches and writings of Sandinista leaders, including:


Vidaluz Meneses of the Ministry of Culture.


Further Reading


John A. Britton, ed., Molding the Hearts and Minds, 1994, ch. by Donald C. Hodges, What is Sandinismo?

Teofilo Cabestrero, Ministers of God, Ministers of the People, 1983.


David E. Whisnant, Rascally Signs in Sacred Places, 1995, esp. chs. 5 and 6 on the Sandinista cultural project and opposition to it.


13. Writing the Nation: National Character Essays; Novels; Poetry

General reading


Gerald Martin, Journeys through the Labyrinth, 1989, esp. chapter 1, 'Myths of the Mestizo Continent’, pp. 3-34.
Nicola Miller, In the Shadow of the State, 1999.
Angel Rama, La ciudad letrada, 1984, trans. as The Lettered City.

The National Character Essays: Main reading

Ezequiel Martínez Estrada, Radiografía de la pampa, 1934, trans. as X-Ray of the Pampa, 1971. Extract (English) ***.
Samuel Ramos, El perfil del hombre y de la cultura en México, 1934, trans. as The Profile of Man and Culture in Mexico, 1962. Extract (English) ***.

Further reading -- Argentina

Ricardo Rojas, La argentinitud, 1916.
Martin Stabb, In Quest of Identity, 1967.

Further reading -- Mexico

Nicola Miller, In the Shadow of the State, 1999, ch. 4.

Novels

José Joaquín Fernández de Lizardi, El periquillo sarniento [1816], trans. as The Itching Parrot, 1942.
Other novels, depending upon the interests of the class.

Further Reading on Novels

Doris Sommer, Foundational Fictions: The Nationalist Romances of Latin America, 1991. A summary is available as one chapter of Homi Bhabha, Nation and Narration, 1990. ***
Fernando Unzueta, ‘Scenes of Reading: Imagining Nations/Romancing History in Spanish America’, in Castro-Klarén and Chasteen, Beyond Imagined Communities.

Poetry

Andrés Bello, Ode to Tropical Agriculture (1826), extracts. ***
Neruda, Canto general (1950), trans. 1993, extracts. ***
Mistral, Poem to Chile (1967), trans. extracts. ***

14. History, Memory and Commemoration

Much of the recent work on this topic draws upon the ideas of Pierre Nora, a historian of the French Revolution. If you are interested in this topic, have a look at his multi-volume work, Lieux de mémoire, some of which has been translated as Realms of Memory: Rethinking the French Past, vols. 1-3, 1996-8. For commentary and critique, see John Gillis, Commemorations. The Politics of National Identity, 1994.

Writing History

Introduction

Further Reading

Nicola Miller, *In the Shadow of the State*, 1999, chapter on history.

Archaeology


Commemoration


Memory and History in Argentina and Chile During and After the Military Regimes

Main Readings

**Further reading**


15. **Visualising the Nation**


**The Mexican Muralists**


Stacie Widdifield, *The Embodiment of the National in Late Nineteenth-century Mexican Painting*, 1996.


**Graphics**


**Photography**


**Exhibitions**

Mauricio Tenorio Trillo, Mexico at the World’s Fairs: Crafting a Modern Nation, 1996.

16. Embodying the Nation

Introduction


Further General Reading

Lisa Shaw and Stephanie Dennison, Pop Culture Latin America!: Media, Arts and Lifestyle, 2005.

Music

Vanessa Knights, ‘Modernity, modernization and melodrama: The bolero in Mexico in the 1930s and 1940s’, in Hart and Young, Contemporary Latin American Cultural Studies, 2003.


### Sport


### Food


### Clothing


17. Icons and Iconography


**Eva Perón**


**The Virgin of Guadalupe**


Isabel de Sena, ‘Engendering the Nation, nationalizing the sacred: Guadalupismo and the cinematic (re)formation of Mexican national consciousness’, in Mercedes F. Durán-Cogan and Antonio Gómez Moriana, eds., *National Identities and Socio-political Changes in Latin America*, 2001 [in LSE library].


**Gabriel Mistral**


18. Mass Media

Susan Dever, *Celluloid Nationalism and Other Melodramas: From postrevolutionary Mexico to fin de siglo Mexamérica*, 2003.

19. Geographies of Nationalism: Territories, Regions and Borders

Introduction


Further Reading

Sarah Radcliffe and Sallie Westwood, *Remaking the Nation: Place, Identity and Politics in Latin America*, 1996 [mostly about Ecuador].

**Case Study: The Mexican-American Border**


**20. Conclusions: The Future of Nationalism in Latin America**

**Main readings:**


**Further reading:**

Essay Questions

Evaluate the theoretical strengths and weaknesses of modernist approaches to nationalism in Latin America.

How important is the concept of gender to understanding nationalism in Latin America?

What role has warfare played in the development of nationalism in Latin America?

‘Indigenismo was the acceptable face of whitening’. Discuss with reference to any two or more Latin American countries.

How far is the ‘rhetoric of inclusion; reality of exclusion’ argument applicable to the relationship of Afro-Latin Americans to the nation-state?

Analyse the relationship between anti-imperialism and nationalism in Latin America.

Why did the United States respond so much more harshly to some cases of nationalization than others?

How effective is education policy in promoting nationalism?

‘Nationalism is inherently antipathetic to a revolutionary ideology.’ Discuss.

To what extent have novels been significant to nation-building in Latin America?

Account for the rise of cultural nationalism in Latin America from 1900 to 1940.

‘National consciousness in twentieth-century Latin America was largely a creation of the state: intellectuals played little part’. Discuss.

How valid for Latin America is Renan’s claim that nationalism entails forgetting?

Analyse the role of visual images of the nation in any two or more Latin American countries.

What problems does the study of material and/or performance culture in Latin America pose for Benedict Anderson’s theory of nationalism?

‘The most decisive force for creating national consciousness in Latin America was undoubtedly the development of modern mass culture, especially as reinforced by technology’ (Hobsbawm). Discuss.
Coursework Essays – Information for UCL Students

Two copies of each essay must be handed in to the History Department reception, with a completed 3-part coversheet, which will be date stamped. The pink copy of the cover sheet will be returned to you as a receipt/proof of submission. Please keep this in case of any query. Essays that are not stamped will receive a mark of 0.

Deadlines

For Full time and second year Part-time Students
Your essay(s) should handed in by Friday 18 December 2009 and Friday 26 March 2010. These are unofficial deadlines which I have set to help you to space out your essay writing assignments. You will not be penalised if you fail to meet these deadlines. However, I may not be able to provide one-to-one tutorial feedback for essays that are submitted after these deadlines. The official deadlines for your essays are: 5 pm on Monday 11 January 2010 (first essay) and 5 pm on Monday 26 April 2010 (second essay). You will be penalized if you fail to meet these official deadlines, unless you have been granted an extension by the Chair of the Board of Examiners.

For First Year Part time Students: Your essays should handed in by Monday 11 January and Monday 26 April 2010. These are unofficial deadlines which I have set to help you to space out your essay writing assignments. You will not be penalised if you fail to meet these deadlines. However, I may not be able to provide one-to-one tutorial feedback for essays that are submitted after these deadlines. The official deadline for your essays is 5 pm on Monday 17th May. You will be penalized if you fail to meet this deadline, unless you have been granted an extension by the Chair of the Board of Examiners.

Students registered for the second term half unit only: Your essay should handed in by Friday 26 March 2010. This is an unofficial deadline which I have set to help you to space out your essay writing assignments. You will not be penalised if you fail to meet this deadline. However, I may not be able to provide one-to-one tutorial feedback for essays that are submitted after these deadlines. The official deadline for your essay(s) is 5 pm on Monday 26th April. You will be penalized if you fail to meet this deadline, unless you have been granted an extension by the Chair of the Board of Examiners.

If my unofficial deadlines clash with other unofficial deadlines set by your other teachers, please bring this to my attention and we will try to negotiate different dates.

You should aim to get your essays in well before the deadlines, not least because of delays caused by faults with computers, printers, photocopiers etc. Do not expect everything to work smoothly. You are expected to plan accordingly. If printing at home, make sure you have a spare toner cartridge for your printer. Computer problems are not accepted as grounds for an extension.

Penalties
Any essay submitted after these dates will be penalised by 10 MARKS PER WEEK (OR PART THEREOF) LATE, up to a maximum of FOUR weeks, after which it will receive a mark of 0. This will be included in the calculation of the overall mark.
Extensions to these deadlines can only be granted by the Chair of the Board of Examiners on the recommendation of your Course Tutor. **He is only likely to do so in cases of serious illness, which must be evidenced by a doctor's certificate, or bereavement. In particular, it is normal to expect up to two weeks’ illness in the course of the two teaching semesters and applications for extensions on medical grounds received in the last two weeks of the second term, where the illness was clearly of less than two weeks’ duration, will not be granted.** Students wishing to apply for an extension should complete a form (available from the Departmental reception) and make an appointment to see their Course Tutor. Please note that applications for extensions will not be accepted on the deadline day itself, or subsequently, except in cases of severe illness or bereavement.

**Legibility**
All essays must be well presented and clear. Please leave wide margins and use double-spacing to allow teachers to write comments. Proof-read word-processed work carefully, and do not rely entirely on spell-checkers - they can introduce mistakes, particularly with proper names.

**Plagiarism**
Essays, while based upon what you have read, heard and discussed, must be entirely your own work. It is very important that you avoid plagiarism, that is the presentation of another person’s thoughts or words as though they were your own. Plagiarism is a form of cheating, and is regarded by the College as a serious offence, which can lead to a student failing a course or courses, or even deregistration. Please see the departmental graduate handbook for further guidance on avoiding plagiarism.

*(Students not registered in the History Department should ask at the Departmental Office for a copy of the Department’s guidelines or download a copy of the departmental graduate handbook from the ‘current students’ section of the history website www.ucl.ac.uk/history).*

Any quotation from the published or unpublished works of other persons must be clearly identified as such by being placed inside quotation marks and students should identify their sources as accurately and fully as possible in footnotes.

Recourse to the services of “ghost-writing” agencies (for example in the preparation of essays or reports) or of outside word-processing agencies which offer correction/improvement of English is strictly forbidden and students who make use of the services of such agencies render themselves liable for an academic penalty.

You should note that UCL has now signed up to use a sophisticated detection system (Turn-It-In) to scan work for evidence of plagiarism, and the Department intends to use this for assessed coursework. This system gives access to billions of sources worldwide, including websites and journals, as well as work previously submitted to the Department, UCL and other universities.